THEORY & THEME

WHY HAVE A CASE THEORY?

YOUR CASE THEORY CONTROLS

- Your discovery & trial preparation
- Jury selection
- What is said in your opening statement
- What is asked on direct and cross examination
- What is said in your closing argument
- What will be in your proposed jury charge

WHY HAVE A CASE THEORY?

EVERYTHING WE DO AT TRIAL WILL BE CONTROLLED BY YOUR CASE THEORY

WHAT IS A CASE THEORY?

- A CASE THEORY CONSISTS OF—
 - LEGAL THEORY
 - FACTUAL THEORY
 - PERSUASIVE THEORY
- EQUALS CASE THEORY

LEGAL THEORY

- THE LAW THAT ENTITLES YOU TO WIN
 - JURY INSTRUCTIONS
 - STATUTES
 - CASE LAW

FACTUAL THEORY

- WHAT HAPPENED IN THE CASE
- WAYS OF GETTING A HANDLE ON THE FACTS
 - CHRONOLOGY
 - PROOF CHART
 - FACTS NOT CONCLUSIONS
 - INFERENCES THAT CAN BE DRAWN FROM THE FACTS

FACTUAL THEORY

- IF TRUE, WHAT ELSE MUST BE TRUE
- HARD FACTS VERSUS SOFT FACTS
- THE MOVIE SCRIPT—WHAT WOULD/SHOULD HAPPEN IN THIS SITUATION
- MOTIVES—WHY DID A PERSON ACT IN THE WAY CLAIMED
- COMMON SENSE—DOES THE STORY COMPORT WITH COMMON SENSE

PERSUASIVE THEORY

- WHY SHOULD YOU WIN AS A MATTER OF FAIRNESS AND JUSTICE
 - WANT TO IDENTIFY THE HERO AND VILLAIN IN THE CASE

THE GRANDMOTHER TEST

- SUMMARIZE YOUR CASE IN ONE PARAGRAPH
 - Using simple, powerful language
 - Incorporating your best facts
 - Explicitly or implicitly refuting your worst facts
 - "This is a case about"

THE GRANDMOTHER TEST

YOUR GRANDMOTHER, AFTER HEARING THE PARAGRAPH, WILL SAY "YOU SHOULD WIN"

TEN COMMANDMENTS OF A GOOD CASE THEORY

- SHORT
- 2. SIMPLE
- 3. SATISFY LEGAL REQUIREMENTS
- CONSISTENT WITH FACTS
- 5. EMOTIONALLY APPEALING—PLACE MORAL BLAME AND APPEAL TO COMMON VALUES

TEN COMMANDMENTS

- 6. EXPLAIN MOTIVES
- 7. TELL A STORY
- 8. USE IMPACT WORDS AND PHRASES
- 9. LIMITED TO ONE THEORY
- 10. YOU MUST BELIEVE IT

THEME

- THE ONE SENTENCE DISTILLATION
- MAKE SURE IT CANNOT BE FLIPPED

- MANY METHODS. THIS IS JUST ONE MODEL
- SELECT YOUR BEST- GOOD FACTS AND YOUR WORST - BAD FACTS

- Brainstorm about good facts and bad facts
 - Facts not conclusions
 - Don't argue at this point cuts of creativity
- Identify our (pick a number) best & worst facts
 - Now we can argue about the facts
 - Is it admissible
 - Is it understandable

- Is it believable
- Is it a hard or soft fact
- Do we need to draw any inferences
- Are the inferences reasonable
- If this fact is true, what other facts must be true (are they?)
- Is it consistent with common sense
- Does it square with the motives we would expect
- Will it be countered by other evidence
- In short, why should the judge or jury believe the best facts & disbelieve the worst facts

- Apply the Grandmother Test
- Develop a theme a one sentence distillation of your case theory
 - Make sure your theme cannot be flipped